PL 구현체를 위한 새로운 커버리지를 제안하기까지의 여정

박지혁 고려대학교 정보대학 컴퓨터학과



SIGPL Summer School 2023 2023.08.24

(with 안승민, 윤동준, 박지희, 김경원, 이강욱, 류석영 교수님)

KOREA UNIVERSITY

Background + Problem









JavaScript is Everywhere









































































































































































































ECMA-262 (JavaScript Spec.)

ndarr

TC 39

ecma







The = operator performs subtraction, producing the difference of its operands: The – operator performs subtraction, producing the difference of its operands.





4 + 2n

The addition operator either performs string concatenation or numeric addition: tor either performs string concatenation or numeric addition.

AdditiveExpression : AdditiveExpression + MultiplicativeExpression

1. Return ? EvaluateStringOrNumericBinaryExpression(AdditiveExpression, +, MultiplicativeExpression).

The = operator performs subtraction, producing the difference of its operands. Forms subtraction, producing the difference of its operands.







2n 4 +

The addition operator either performs string concatenation or numeric addition: tor either performs string concatenation or numeric addition.

AdditiveExpression : AdditiveExpression + MultiplicativeExpression

1. Return ? EvaluateStringOrNumericBinaryExpression(AdditiveExpression, +, MultiplicativeExpression).

<u>The - operator performs subtraction, producing the difference of its operands</u>.

EvaluateStringOrNumericBinaryExpression (*leftOperand*, *opText*, *rightOperand*) orms

- 1. Let *lref* be ? Evaluation of *leftOperand*.
- 2. Let *lval* be ? GetValue(*lref*).
- 3. Let *rref* be ? Evaluation of *rightOperand*.
- 4. Let *rval* be ? GetValue(*rref*).
- 5. Return ? ApplyStringOrNumericBinaryOperator(*lval*, *opText*, *rval*).







4 + 2n

The addition operator either performs string concatenation or numeric addition: tor either performs string concatenation or numeric addition.









4 + 2n

The addition operator either performs string concatenation or numeric addition: tor either performs string concatenation or numeric addition.









4 + 2n

The addition operator either performs string concatenation or numeric addition: tor either performs string concatenation or numeric addition.









property with the attribute value { [[Set]]: **undefined** }, or to property of an obj Language Specification (ECMAn 262) and International Specific Language Specific Language Specific Language Specific Language Specific Language Language Specific Language Lang thrown. Additionally, it is a runtime error if the *lref* in step 8, 7, 7, 6 is a reference to a data property with the attribute value { [[Writable]]: false }, to an accessor JS th the attribute value { [[Set]]: **undefined** }, or to a non-existent **TypeError** 4 + 2nan object for which the IsExtensible predicate returns the value false. In these cases a **TypeError** exception is thrown. The addition operator either performs string concatenation or numeric addition: tor either performs string concatenation or numeric addition.





ApplyStringOrNumericBinaryOperator (*lval, opText, rval*)

- 1. If *opText* is **+**, then
 - a. Let *lprim* be ? ToPrimitive(*lval*).
 - b. Let *rprim* be ? ToPrimitive(*rval*).
 - c. If *lprim* is a String or *rprim* is a String, then
 - i. Let *lstr* be ? ToString(*lprim*).
 - ii. Let *rstr* be ? ToString(*rprim*).
 - iii. Return the string-concatenation of *lstr* and *rstr*.

d. Set *lval* to *lprim*.

e. Set *rval* to *rprim*.

. . .

- 2. NOTE: At this point, it must be a numeric operation.
- 3. Let *lnum* be ? ToNumeric(*lval*).
- 4. Let *rnum* be ? ToNumeric(*rval*).
- 5. If Type(*lnum*) is not Type(*rnum*), throw a TypeError exception.






































ECMA-262 (JavaScript Spec.)







Conformance







ECMA-262 (JavaScript Spec.)













ECMA-262 (JavaScript Spec.)







Test262 (Official Test Suite)







ECMA-262 (JavaScript Spec.)



GraalVM QuickJS

Test262 (Official Test Suite)



Problem - Manual Approach



ECMA-262 (JavaScript Spec.)









[ASE'20] J. Park, J. Park, S. An, and S. Ryu, JISET: JavaScript IR-based Semantics Extraction Toolchain









[ASE'20] J. Park, J. Park, S. An, and S. Ryu, JISET: JavaScript IR-based Semantics Extraction Toolchain





JISET (JavaScript IR-based Semantics Extraction Toolchain)



PLRG



JISET (JavaScript IR-based Semantics Extraction Toolchain)



JISET - Metalanguage for Spec. (ECMA-262)

Programs	P	Э	P
Functions	${\mathcal F}$	Э	f
Variables	X	Э	X
Labels	L	Э	l
Instructions	Ţ	Э	i
Expressions	3	\ni	е
References	\mathcal{R}	Э	r
Values			
Primitive Values			
JS ASTs			


```
P ::= f^*
f ::= syntax^? def x(x^*) \{[l : i]^*\}
```

- $i ::= r := e | x := \{\} | x := e(e^*)$ | if e l l | return e $e ::= v^p | op(e^*) | r$ $r ::= x | e[e] | e[e]_{js}$
 - • $v \in \mathbb{V} = \mathbb{A} \uplus \mathbb{V}^p \uplus \mathbb{T} \uplus \mathcal{F}$
 - $v^{p} \in \mathbb{V}^{p} = \mathbb{V}_{bool} \uplus \mathbb{V}_{int} \uplus \mathbb{V}_{str} \uplus \cdots$ $t \in \mathbb{T}$
 - •

JISET - Metalanguage for Spec. (ECMA-262)

Programs	P	Э	Р	::=
Functions	${\mathcal F}$	Э	f	::=
Variables	X	Э	Χ	
Labels	L	Э	l	
Instructions	\mathcal{I}	Э	i	::=
Expressions	3	Э	e	::=
References	R	Э	r	::=
Values				υ
Primitive Values				vp
JS ASTs				t
and the structure in the state of the structure of the	1 M 1 M 1 M	S		

 $= f^*$ = syntax[?] def x(x^{*}) { $[l:i]^*$ }

$$r := e | x := {} | x := e(e^{*})$$

if $e l l | return e$
= $v^{p} | op(e^{*}) | r$
= $x | e[e] | e[e]_{js}$

 $v \in \mathbb{V} = \mathbb{A} \uplus \mathbb{V}^{p} \uplus \mathbb{T} \uplus \mathcal{F}$ $\mathbf{v}^{p} \in \mathbb{V}^{p} = \mathbb{V}_{bool} \uplus \mathbb{V}_{int} \uplus \mathbb{V}_{str} \uplus \cdots$ $\mathbf{f} \in \mathbb{T}$

thrown. Additionally, it is a runtime error if the *lref* in step 8, 7, 7, 6 is a reference to a data property with the attribute value { [[Writable]]: false }, to an accessor property with the attribute value {[[Set]]: undefined for teamon-txisters on Diero percent mobile for which the IsExtensible predicate returns the alteras. Die Content of the balance of

In these cases a **TypeError** exception is thrown.

ApplyStringOrNumericBinaryOperator (*lval, opText, rval*)

1. If *opText* is **+**, then

a. Let *lprim* be ? ToPrimitive(*lval*).

b. Let *rprim* be ? ToPrimitive(*rval*).

c. If *lprim* is a String or *rprim* is a String, then

i. Let *lstr* be ? ToString(*lprim*).

ii. Let *rstr* be ? ToString(*rprim*).

iii. Return the string-concatenation of *lstr* and *rstr*.

d. Set *lval* to *lprim*.

e. Set *rval* to *rprim*.

2. NOTE: At this point, it must be a numeric operation.

3. Let *lnum* be ? ToNumeric(*lval*).

4. Let *rnum* be ? ToNumeric(*rval*).

5. If Type(*lnum*) is not Type(*rnum*), throw a **TypeError** exception.

. . .


```
def ApplyStringOrNumericBinaryOperator(
  lval, opText, rval
  if (= opText "+") {
    let lprim = [? ToPrimitive(lval)]
    let rprim = [? ToPrimitive(rval)]
    if (|| (= (typeof lprim) @String)
           (= (typeof rprim) @String)) {
      let lstr = [? ToString(lprim)]
      let rstr = [? ToString(rprim)]
      return (concat lstr rstr)
    lval = lprim
    rval = rprim
  let lnum = [? ToNumeric(lval)]
  let rnum = [? ToNumeric(rval)]
  if (! (= (typeof lnum) (typeof rnum))) {
    return comp[~throw~](new TypeError)
```


JISET - Evaluation

<> Code	O Issues 11	រឿ Pull requests	4	R Discussions	🕑 Acti
---------	-------------------------------	-------------------------	---	----------------------	--------

ESMeta

ECMAScript Specification (ECMA-262) Metalanguage		
 ▲ BSD-3-Clause license ☆ 135 stars ♀ 13 forks ⑦ 7 watching - Activity ④ Public repository 		
لا main ج لا Branches کے Tags		•••
branches vrags jhnaldo	✓ on Jun 15	Ŀ
⋮Ξ README.md		Ø
CI passing license BSD-3-Clause release v0.3.2 PRs 105 sla site jekyll doc scaladoc	ck esmeta	
ESMeta		

ESMeta is an ECMAScript Specification Metalanguage. This framework extracts a mechanized specification from a given version of ECMAScript/JavaScript specification (ECMA-262) and automatically generates language-based tools.

https://github.com/es-meta/esmeta

[ICSE'21] J. Park, S. An, D. Youn, G. Kim, and S. Ryu, JEST: N+1-version Differential Testing of Both JavaScript Engines and Specification

JEST (JavaScript Engines and Specification Tester)

Conformance Test Synthesis using Coverage-guided Fuzzing in Mechanized Spec.

property with the attribute value [[[Oct]]. **unachined**], of to a non existent JEST - Goverage-guides Fruzzing (in Spec.)

- 3. Let *lnum* be ? ToNumeric(*lval*).
- 4. Let *rnum* be ? ToNumeric(*rval*).
- 5. If Type(*lnum*) is not Type(*rnum*), throw a TypeError exception.
- 6. If *lnum* is a BigInt, then

7. Else,

- - -

. . .

ApplyStringOrNumericBinaryOperator (*lval, opText, rval*)

property with the attribute value [[[Oct]]. **anachinea**], of to a non existent JEST - Goverage-guided for which the IsExtensible predicate returns the value false.

- 3. Let *lnum* be ? ToNumeric(*lval*).
- 4. Let *rnum* be ? ToNumeric(*rval*).
- 6. If *lnum* is a BigInt, then

7. Else,

property with the attribute value [[[Det]]. **anachinea**], or to a non existent JEST - Goverage-guides Frozzing (in Spec.)

. . .

7. Else,

- 3. Let *lnum* be ? ToNumeric(*lval*).
- 4. Let *rnum* be ? ToNumeric(*rval*).
- 6. If *lnum* is a BigInt, then

property with the attribute value [[[Det]]. **anachinea**], or to a non existent JEST - Goverage-guides Frozzing (in Spec.)

. . .

7. Else,

3 + 2

- 3. Let *lnum* be ? ToNumeric(*lval*).
- 4. Let *rnum* be ? ToNumeric(*rval*).
- 6. If *lnum* is a BigInt, then

function f() {}

+ \$assert.equal(Object.getPrototypeOf(f), Function.prototype);

- \$assert.verifyProperty(f, "prototype", { +writable: true, ╋ enumerable: false, +configurable: false, + **}**); +

+ ...

function f() {}

+ \$assert.equal(Object.getPrototypeOf(f), Function.prototype);

- \$assert.verifyProperty(f, "prototype", { +writable: true, ╋ enumerable: false, +configurable: false, + }); +

+ ...

Prototype Chain

function f() {}

+ \$assert.equal(Object.getPrototypeOf(f), Function.prototype);

+ ...

Prototype Chain

Property Descriptor

function f() {}

+ \$assert.equal(Object.getPrototypeOf(f), Function.prototype);

+ ...

Prototype Chain

Property Descriptor

Property Order

function f() {}

+ \$assert.equal(Object.getPrototypeOf(f), Function.prototype);

+ \$assert.compare(Reflect.ownKeys(f), ['length', 'name', 'prototype'], f);

Prototype Chain

Property Descriptor

Property Order

JEST - Evaluation

JEST synthesized 1,700 conformance tests from ES2020

TABLE II: The number of engine bugs detected by JEST

Engines	Exc	Abort	Var	Obj	Desc	Key	
V8	0	0	0	0	0	2	(
GraalVM	6	0	0	0	2	8	(
QuickJS	3	0	1	0	0	2	(
Moddable XS	12	0	0	0	3	5	(
Total	21	0	1	0	5	17	(

try { ++undefined; } catch (e) { }

"Right now, we are running Test262 and the V8 and Nashorn unit test suites in our CI for every change, it might make sense to add your suite as well."

- A Developer of GraalVM

[PLDI'23] J. Park, D. Youn, K, Lee, and S. Ryu, Feature-Sensitive Coverage for Conformance Testing of Programming Language Implementations

Mechanized Spec.

Conformance Tests

Graph Coverage

Mechanized Spec.

Conformance Tests

Mechanized Spec.

**----

Conformance Tests

Test Requirements (TRs)

Are they sufficient?

Coverage Criteria

Motivating Example 1 with Node Coverage

Motivating Example 1 with Node Coverage JS **TypeError** 2n +**Program P**₁ feat ADD **Evaluation** of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr* 1. Return ? EvalStrOrNumBinExpr (AddExpr, +, MulExpr).

Abstract Algorithms in ECMA-262 (ES13, 2022), JavaScript Language Specification

Motivating Example 1 with Node Coverage

Abstract Algorithms in ECMA-262 (ES13, 2022), JavaScript Language Specification

• • •

• • •

5. If **Type**(*lnum*) is different from **Type**(*rnum*), throw a **TypeError** exception.

Motivating Example 1 with Node Coverage

PLRG

Abstract Algorithms in ECMA-262 (ES13, 2022), JavaScript Language Specification



PLRG





PLRG























































1 class A {} class B {} Not Important $2 \text{ class C } \{$ static Object id (Object v, int i){ return i >= 0 ? id(v, i-1) : v;public static void main (){ 6 int i = input(); A a = (A) id(new A(), i); //Query 1 B b = (B) id(new B(), i); //Query 210 11 }

[OOPSLA'18] M. Jeon, S. Jeong, and H, Oh, Precise and Scalable Points-to Analysis via Data-Driven Context Tunneling





k-Callsite Sensitivity

























• Feature-Sensitive (FS) coverage criterion divides the given TRs with the innermost enclosing language features



FS Coverage

TR = (Feature, given **TR)**







• Feature-Sensitive (FS) coverage criterion divides the given TRs with the innermost enclosing language features



Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*



1. Return ? EvalStrOrNumBinExpr (AddExpr, –, MulExpr).







FS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Node)



• Feature-Sensitive (FS) coverage criterion divides the given TRs with the innermost enclosing language features



Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*



1. Return ? EvalStrOrNumBinExpr (AddExpr, –, MulExpr).







FS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Node)



• Feature-Sensitive (FS) coverage criterion divides the given TRs with the innermost enclosing language features



Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*









FS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Node)



• Feature-Sensitive (FS) coverage criterion divides the given TRs with the innermost enclosing language features



Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*









FS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Node)



• Feature-Sensitive (FS) coverage criterion divides the given TRs with the innermost enclosing language features



Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*





FS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Node)



• Feature-Sensitive (FS) coverage criterion divides the given TRs with the innermost enclosing language features



Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*











Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*

1. Return ? EvalStrOrNumBinExpr (AddExpr, +, MulExpr).



Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* – *MulExpr*





TypeError

2-FS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature ≤ 2 , Node)





Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*

1. Return ? EvalStrOrNumBinExpr (AddExpr, +, MulExpr).





Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* – *MulExpr*









Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*

1. Return ? EvalStrOrNumBinExpr (AddExpr, +, MulExpr).



















Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*

PLRG







Evaluation of *AddExpr* : *AddExpr* + *MulExpr*

EvalStrOrNumBinExpr (*lval*, *opText*, *rval*)

PLRG


























Motivating Example 2









• k-Feature-Call-Path-Sensitive (k-FCPS) coverage criterion divides the k-FS TRs with the call-paths from the innermost enclosing language feature PLRG

k-Feature-Call-Path-Sensitive (k-FCPS) Coverage



k-FCPS Coverage







• k-Feature-Call-Path-Sensitive (k-FCPS) coverage criterion divides the k-FS TRs with the call-paths from the innermost enclosing language feature PLRG

k-Feature-Call-Path-Sensitive (k-FCPS) Coverage

1-FCPS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Call-Path, Node)

k-FCPS Coverage









• k-Feature-Call-Path-Sensitive (k-FCPS) coverage criterion divides the k-FS TRs with the call-paths from the innermost enclosing language feature

1-FCPS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Call-Path, Node)



k-FCPS Coverage









• k-Feature-Call-Path-Sensitive (k-FCPS) coverage criterion divides the k-FS TRs with the call-paths from the innermost enclosing language feature

+ Symbol()

Program P₅

TypeError

1-FCPS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Call-Path, Node)



k-FCPS Coverage









• k-Feature-Call-Path-Sensitive (k-FCPS) coverage criterion divides the k-FS TRs with the call-paths from the innermost enclosing language feature

1-FCPS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Call-Path, Node)

k-FCPS Coverage









• k-Feature-Call-Path-Sensitive (k-FCPS) coverage criterion divides the k-FS TRs with the call-paths from the innermost enclosing language feature

1-FCPS Node Coverage

TR = (Feature, Call-Path, Node)

k-FCPS Coverage



















Evaluation

- JavaScript Specification ECMA-262 for ES13 (2022)
- JavaScript Implementations 4 Engines and 4 Transpilers

Kind	Name	Version	Release
	V 8	v10.8.121	2022.10.06
Engine	JSC	v615.1.10	2022.10.26
	GraalJS	v22.2.0	2022.07.26
	SpiderMonkey	v107.0b4	2022.10.24
	Babel	v7.19.1	2022.09.15
Tropopilor	SWC	v1.3.10	2022.10.21
Iranspiler	Terser	v5.15.1	2022.10.05
	Obfuscator	v4.0.0	2022.02.15



5 different *k***-FS and** *k***-FCPS coverage criteria** • Conformance Test Synthesis in 50 hours with 0-FS / 1-FS / 2-FS / 1-FCPS / 2-FCPS



Kind Engine Transpiler	Nama	Vorcion	Release	#	Detected Uniqu	e Bugs
MIIIU	INAIIIC	VEI SIOII		# New	# Confirmed	# Reported
Kind Engine Transpiler	V8	v10.8.121	2022.10.06	0	0	4
	JSC	v615.1.10	2022.10.26	15	15	24
Engine	GraalJS	v22.2.0	2022.07.26	9	9	10
	SpiderMonkey	v107.0b4	2022.10.24	1	3	4
		Total		# Detected Unique Bugs # New # Confirmed # Report 0 0 0 15 15 0 9 9 9 1 3 0 25 27 0 30 30 0 27 27 1 0 0 0 58 58 1 83 85 1	42	
	Babel	v7.19.1	2022.09.15	30	30	35
	SWC	v1.3.10	2022.10.21	27	27	41
Transpiler	Terser	v5.15.1	2022.10.05	1	1	18
	Obfuscator	v4.0.0	2022.02.15	0	0	7
		Total		58	58	101
	Total			83	85	143





Kind Engine Transpiler	Nama	Vorcion	Dologo	#	Detected Uniqu	e Bugs
MIIIU	INAIIIC	VEI SIOII	iterease	# New	# Confirmed	# Reported
Kind Engine Transpiler	V8	v10.8.121	2022.10.06	0	0	4
	JSC	v615.1.10	2022.10.26	15	15	24
Engine	GraalJS	v22.2.0	2022.07.26	9	9	10
	SpiderMonkey	v107.0b4	2022.10.24	1	3	4
		Total		# Detected UniqueRelease# New# Confirmed $2022.10.06$ 00 $2022.10.26$ 1515 $2022.07.26$ 99 $2022.07.26$ 99 $2022.10.24$ 13 $2022.09.15$ 3030 $2022.10.21$ 2727 $2022.02.15$ 00 58 58 83 85	42	
	Babel	v7.19.1	2022.09.15	30	30	35
	SWC	v1.3.10	2022.10.21	27	27	41
Transpiler	Terser	v5.15.1	2022.10.05	1	1	18
	Obfuscator	v4.0.0	2022.02.15	0	0	7
		Total		58	58	101
	Total			83	85	143





Kind Engine Transpiler	Nama	Vorcion	Roloso	#	Detected Uniqu	e Bugs
MIIIU	INAIIIC	VEI SIOII	Nelease	# New	# Confirmed	# Reported
Kind Engine Transpiler	V8	v10.8.121	2022.10.06	0	0	4
	JSC	v615.1.10	2022.10.26	15	15	24
Engine	GraalJS	v22.2.0	2022.07.26	9	9	10
	SpiderMonkey	v107.0b4	2022.10.24	1	3	4
		Total		elease# Detected Unique E# New# Confirmed# $22.10.06$ 00 $22.10.26$ 1515 $22.07.26$ 99 $22.10.24$ 13 $22.09.15$ 3030 $22.10.21$ 2727 $22.02.15$ 00 58 5858 83 85	42	
	Babel	v7.19.1	2022.09.15	30	30	35
	SWC	v1.3.10	2022.10.21	27	27	41
Transpiler	Terser	v5.15.1	2022.10.05	1	1	18
	Obfuscator	v4.0.0	2022.02.15	0	0	7
		Total		58	58	101
	Total			83	85	143





Kind Engine Transpiler	Nama	Vorcion	Version Release		Detected Uniqu	e Bugs
MIIIQ	Iname	VEI SIOII	iterease	# New	# Confirmed	# Reported
	V8	v10.8.121	2022.10.06	0	0	4
	JSC	v615.1.10	2022.10.26	15	15	24
Engine	GraalJS	v22.2.0	2022.07.26	9	9	10
	SpiderMonkey	v107.0b4	2022.10.24	1	3	4
	NameV8JSCGraalJSSpiderMonkeyBabelSWCTerserObfuscatorTota	Total		25	27	42
	Babel	v7.19.1	2022.09.15	30	30	35
	SWC	v1.3.10	2022.10.21	27	27	41
Transpiler	Terser	v5.15.1	2022.10.05	1	1	18
	Obfuscator	v4.0.0	2022.02.15	0	0	7
		Total		58	58	101
	Total			83	85	143





Coverage Criteria Ca	# Cove	red k-F(CP)S	# Sun Tost	# Bug	
Coverage Citteria CG	# Node	# Branch	# Total	# Syn. 18st	# Dug
0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55
1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83
1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87
2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102
2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111





Coverage Criteria Ca	# Cover	red k-F(CP)S	-TR (k)	# Sun Tost	# Bug	
Coverage Cinteria CG	# Node	# Branch	# Total	π Syn. rest	# Dug	
0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55	>+28
1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83	K L
1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87	
2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102	•
2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111	





Coverage Criteria Ca	# Cover	red k-F(CP)S	5-TR (k)	# Sun Tost	# Bug	
Coverage Citteria CG	# Node	# Branch	# Total	# Syn. 1est	# Dug	
0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55	>+28
1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83	
1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87	
2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102	
2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111	



Synthesized with **1-FS** but not with **0-FS**







Coverage Criteria Ca	# Cover	red k-F(CP)S	5-TR (k)	# Sun Tost	# Bug	
Coverage Citteria CG	# Node	# Branch	# Total	# Syll. 10st	# Dug	
0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55	>+28
1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83	K
1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87)+19
2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102	K
2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111	



Synthesized with **1-FS** but not with **0-FS**







•	Coverage Criteria Ca	# Cover	red k-F(CP)S	5-TR (k)	# Syn Test	# Bug	
	Coverage Citteria CG	# Node	# Branch	# Total	# Syn. 18st	# Dug	
	0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55	+28
	1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83	K
	1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87)+19
	2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102	K
	2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111	



PLRG



Synthesized with **1-FS** but not with **0-FS**

class C { async ["f"](){} }



Synthesized with 2-FS but not with 1-FS



Coverage Criteria Ca	# Cove	red k-F(CP)S	# Sun Toot	# Bug	
Coverage Cinteria CG	# Node	# Branch	# Total	# Syll. 16st	# Dug
0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55
1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83
1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87
2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102
2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111





Coverage Criteria Ca	# Cover	red k-F(CP)S	-TR (k)	# Sun Tost	# Bug	•
Coverage Cinteria CG	# Node	# Branch	# Total	# 3y11. 18st	# Dug	
0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55	
1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83	\rightarrow +4
1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87	
2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102	
2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111	-





Coverage Criteria $C_{\mathbb{G}}$	# Covered k-F(CP)S-TR (k)			# Sum Toot	# Buo	
	# Node	# Branch	# Total	# 5y11. 1est	# Dug	
0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55	
1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83	$\rightarrow +4$
1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87	Ľ
2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102	\+9
2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111	Ľ





Coverage Criteria $C_{\mathbb{G}}$	# Covered k-F(CP)S-TR (k)			# Sym Tost	# Bug	
	# Node	# Branch	# Total	# Syll. 16st	# Dug	
0-FS node-or-branch (0-fs)	10.0	5.6	15.6	2,111	55	
1-FS node-or-branch (1-fs)	79.3	45.7	125.0	6,766	83	$\rightarrow +4$
1-FCPS node-or-branch (1-fcps)	179.7	97.6	277.3	9,092	87	Ľ
2-FS node-or-branch (2-fs)	1,199.8	696.3	1,896.1	97,423	102	\+9
2-FCPS node-or-branch (2-fcps)	2,323.1	1,297.6	3,620.7	122,589	111	Z





.normalize .call(0, "");



Synthesized with 1-FCPS or 2-FCPS but not with 1-FS or 2-FS

















































